The concert ticket

Take one role each. Speak, point, or write. Keep this side up.

Partners _____ Pair number _____

1 TRY THE MOVE IN THIS CLASSROOM SCENARIO

U.S. ticket websites, 2015

Your ticket budget is $48. One site has a seat near the stage. Another shows $46 total for a seat farther back.

Partner 1 / Ticket site

Say $42. Wait for the buyer's first move, then reveal the required $8 fee. The total is $50.

Partner 2 / Ticket buyer

Cover the other role with your slip. Hear the first price and pick a move below. Hear the full price and choose again.

First move: near seat / farther seat / ask for total / pass. Final choice: farther seat / pass.

Who has to spend time finding out what a ticket really costs?

2 CAST YOUR FIRST VOTE

Circle one together. If divided, circle your choices and mark SPLIT.

1 Let each site decide when to show fees.

2 Make sites show the full price on the first screen.

3 Limit how much sites can charge in fees.

3 MAKE A PREDICTION

Predict the change below, whichever option you chose.

When fees show up at the end instead of the start, spending per visitor will...

Circle one. Rise / Stay about the same / Fall

If time, write why.

The concert ticket

Switch who reads and writes. Short phrases are enough.

4 READ THE STUDY AND TRY THE MOVE AGAIN

In 2015, StubHub split U.S. visitors into two groups by chance. One saw the total price first. The other saw required fees on the screen just before paying. The study followed spending for ten days.

What the study counted	Late fees vs. full price first
Chance of buying at least once	**14.1% higher**
Average spending per visitor	**20.6% higher**

The spending average includes people who paid $0. For scale, if the group that saw the total first averaged $100 per visitor, the late-fee group would average about $121.

Which group spent more per visitor? By about how much?

Try again aloud. The site says $50 first. What would you click or skip now?

5 CAST YOUR FINAL VOTE

Vote with your partner before talking to other pairs. Circle your choices and mark SPLIT if you disagree.

(1) Site decides / (2) Full price first / (3) Limit fees

Ticket sites set their displays. A U.S. consumer agency can check whether sites follow a price rule.

Use your result. Why this choice? Who should act, and who might still lose out?

6 REPORT FROM YOUR SEAT

Tally final votes at your table. Count each split once. Prepare your line.

Pair 1 Compared with… Pair 2 The rule changed… Pair 3 Someone still pays…

Lecture term. Imperfect information. A buyer has trouble seeing the full price before choosing.

If time. The study tested when fees appear. What would you measure to judge a limit on fees?

The first job

Take one role each. Speak, point, or write. Keep this side up.

Partners _____ Pair number _____

1 TRY THE MOVE IN THIS CLASSROOM SCENARIO

U.S. restaurant chains before 2018

Two sandwich shops use the same brand but have different owners. Their agreements with the brand limit hiring from other shops in the chain. This is a no-poach rule. The worker never signed it.

Partner 1 / Worker

Ask for the higher-paying job at your partner's shop. Your other option is to apply at a different brand, farther from home.

Partner 2 / Hiring manager

You want an experienced worker. The hiring rule blocks the offer. Say you'll ask the brand for an exception, or turn the worker down.

Worker's move: wait for an exception / apply farther away / stay put.

Which job can the worker pursue without an exception?

2 CAST YOUR FIRST VOTE

Circle one together. If divided, circle your choices and mark SPLIT.

1 Keep the hiring rule. Workers can apply to other brands.

2 Make the chains tell workers about the hiring rule.

3 Have Washington state's top lawyer make chains drop the rule.

3 MAKE A PREDICTION

Predict the change below, whichever option you chose.

After chains drop the rule, the yearly pay they advertise in job listings will...

Circle one. Rise / Stay about the same / Fall

If time, write why.

The first job

Switch who reads and writes. Short phrases are enough.

4 READ THE STUDY AND TRY THE MOVE AGAIN

From 2018 to 2020, Washington's attorney general, the state's top lawyer, got participating chains across several industries to end the rule nationwide. Researchers compared pay trends at those chains with trends at employers that had yet to sign or never signed such agreements.

Where the pay estimate came from	Change vs. the comparison employers
Yearly pay listed in job ads	**About 6% higher**
Pay that workers said they earned	**About 2.3% higher**

Job ads and workers' reports are two sources. Each percentage is a separate estimate across jobs.

Use one figure. What kind of pay changed, and compared with whom?

Try again aloud. The brand drops the rule. The manager makes or declines an offer. The worker responds.

5 CAST YOUR FINAL VOTE

Vote with your partner before talking to other pairs. Circle your choices and mark SPLIT if you disagree.

(1) Keep the rule / (2) Tell workers / (3) End the rule

The state's lawyer can enforce a binding agreement. The chains change their contracts.

Use your result. Why this choice? Who should act, and who might still lose out?

6 REPORT FROM YOUR SEAT

Tally final votes at your table. Count each split once. Prepare your line.

Pair 1 Compared with… Pair 2 The rule changed… Pair 3 Someone still pays…

Lecture term. Employer market power. Employers can set terms more easily when workers have fewer realistic job options.

If time. How could you check whether ending the hiring rule changed how much training shops provided?

The grocery bag

Take one role each. Speak, point, or write. Keep this side up.

Partners _____ Pair number _____

1 TRY THE MOVE IN THIS CLASSROOM SCENARIO

Ireland before the 2002 bag charge

A shopper forgot a reusable bag. The store has free thin plastic bags. The cashier can also fetch a cardboard box.

Partner 1 / Cashier

You want to keep the line moving. Offer a free bag. If the shopper asks for a box, decide whether to take the time to get it.

Partner 2 / Shopper

Take the free bag, ask for a box, or carry the groceries loose. Decide after hearing the cashier's reply.

What leaves the store? Plastic bag / box / loose items.

If the bag ends up in the street or a stream, who has to deal with it?

2 CAST YOUR FIRST VOTE

Circle one together. If divided, circle your choices and mark SPLIT.

1 Let stores decide whether to charge for bags.

2 Charge 15 euro cents for each thin plastic shopping bag.

3 Stop stores from giving out or selling those bags.

3 MAKE A PREDICTION

Predict the change below, whichever option you chose.

Soon after the 15-cent charge starts, the number of plastic bags used per person in a year will...

Circle one. Rise / Stay about the same / Fall

If time, write why.

The grocery bag

Switch who reads and writes. Short phrases are enough.

4 READ THE STUDY AND TRY THE MOVE AGAIN

Ireland began charging 15 euro cents (€0.15) for plastic checkout bags like these in March 2002. These are national estimates of the average number someone used in a year.

When	Plastic shopping bags per person in a year
Before the charge	328
Soon after the charge began	21
In 2006	31

This is a before-and-after comparison of bag use. To check whether the streets got cleaner, you would also need a way to count litter.

Use two numbers to describe what happened to bag use soon after the charge began.

Try again aloud. The cashier says a bag costs 15 cents. What does the shopper pick now?

5 CAST YOUR FINAL VOTE

Vote with your partner before talking to other pairs. Circle your choices and mark SPLIT if you disagree.

(1) Store decides / (2) Charge for bags / (3) Ban thin bags

Ireland's national government set the charge. Stores collected it at checkout.

Use your result. Why this choice? Who should act, and who might still lose out?

6 REPORT FROM YOUR SEAT

Tally final votes at your table. Count each split once. Prepare your line.

Pair 1 Compared with… Pair 2 The rule changed… Pair 3 Someone still pays…

Lecture term. Negative externality. A choice can pass a cost to someone who had no say in it.

If time. How many fewer bags per person were used in 2006 than before the charge? Start with 328 − 31.

Cork City Council, Plastic Bag Levy. OECD, Ireland environmental review (2010), Box 4.3.

The walk home

Take one role each. Speak, point, or write. Keep this side up.

Partners _____ Pair number _____

1 TRY THE MOVE IN THIS CLASSROOM SCENARIO

New York City, 2016

A shared courtyard light needs $8 more. Pay only if the total reaches $8 or more. Extra money buys bulbs. Once it's on, any passerby can use the light.

Partner 1 / Resident coming home

You often walk here after dark. Secretly write $0, $4, or $8 on your own slip. That is how much you promise to pay.

Partner 2 / Neighbor

You get home before dark, but some visitors come late. Secretly write $0, $4, or $8 on your slip. Then show each other.

Add the two amounts. Total $____. Did the light get funded? Yes / no.

Who could use the light even if they paid $0?

2 CAST YOUR FIRST VOTE

Circle one together. If divided, circle your choices and mark SPLIT.

1 Ask neighbors and businesses for donations.

2 Use city money to install and maintain a light.

3 Use city money to pay people to walk with residents at night.

3 MAKE A PREDICTION

Predict the change below, whichever option you chose.

At sites with extra lights, serious crimes outdoors at night will...

Circle one. Rise / Stay about the same / Fall

If time, write why.

The walk home

Switch who reads and writes. Short phrases are enough.

4 READ THE STUDY AND TRY THE MOVE AGAIN

In 2016, researchers chose New York City public housing sites by chance to get extra temporary lights. They compared serious crimes at sites with and without the extra lights.

What the number counts	Finding in the New York study
Serious crimes outdoors at night	**About 36% fewer with extra lights**
Share of all serious crimes outdoors at night	**About 11 out of 100**
Example if other crimes stayed steady	**About 4 fewer out of 100 serious crimes**

Picture 100 serious crimes. About 11 took place outdoors at night. A 36% drop in those 11 is about 4 fewer out of 100 if other crimes stay steady. The study tested the lights. Different ways to pay would need their own comparison.

Which crimes did the roughly 36% drop refer to?

Try again aloud. The light is on. Each person decides whether to take the lit path. Can someone who paid $0 use it?

5 CAST YOUR FINAL VOTE

Vote with your partner before talking to other pairs. Circle your choices and mark SPLIT if you disagree.

(1) Donations / (2) City-funded light / (3) Paid walking partners

Neighbors can collect donations. A city housing agency can pay for lights and keep them working.

Use your result. Why this choice? Who should act, and who might still lose out?

6 REPORT FROM YOUR SEAT

Tally final votes at your table. Count each split once. Prepare your line.

Pair 1 Compared with… Pair 2 The rule changed… Pair 3 Someone still pays…

Lecture term. Public good. Many can use it at once, and it is hard to keep out people who paid nothing.

If time. What could you measure to see if donations would pay for upkeep year after year?

The first apartment

Take one role each. Speak, point, or write. Keep this side up.

Partners _____ Pair number _____

1 TRY THE MOVE IN THIS CLASSROOM SCENARIO

San Francisco before the 1994 rule change

A renter's lease (rental agreement) is ending. The owner lives in one of the three apartments. Rent control limits increases for renters who stay. This building is outside the rule.

Partner 1 / Renter

Ask to stay for two years at the same rent. You can sign the owner's offer or start looking for another apartment.

Partner 2 / Owner

Offer the same rent for two years or for one year. With one year, you can ask for more rent when that year ends.

What does the renter do? Sign for one year / sign for two / look elsewhere.

Who still faces a possible rent increase or has to find an open apartment?

2 CAST YOUR FIRST VOTE

Circle one together. If divided, circle your choices and mark SPLIT.

1 Keep this kind of building outside the rent limit.

2 Also limit rent increases in buildings like this one.

3 Keep the old rule and help renters with low incomes pay rent.

3 MAKE A PREDICTION

Predict the change below, whichever option you chose.

Once the rent limit starts, the chance current renters stay at the same address will...

Circle one. Rise / Stay about the same / Fall

If time, write why.

The first apartment

Switch who reads and writes. Short phrases are enough.

4 READ THE STUDY AND TRY THE MOVE AGAIN

In 1994, San Francisco extended its rent limits to older buildings with a few apartments. Researchers compared them and their renters with similar, newer buildings and renters that the change left outside the rule.

Who or what the study followed	Change vs. the comparison group
Chance an existing renter stayed at the same address in 2000–04	**About 20% higher**
Rental housing supplied by owners newly under the rule	**About 15% less over time**

Some owners sold apartments to people who would live in them or rebuilt their buildings. Homes can leave the rental market and still house people.

Which number matters if you already rent there? Which matters if you're looking for your first rental? Why?

Try again aloud. In this replay, the owner wants $100 more per month. The rule allows up to $50 more. What can the owner offer? Does the renter stay?

5 CAST YOUR FINAL VOTE

Vote with your partner before talking to other pairs. Circle your choices and mark SPLIT if you disagree.

(1) Keep old rule / (2) Extend rent limits / (3) Give rent aid

The city can set rent limits or run a rent-aid program. Owners decide whether to keep units for rent.

Use your result. Why this choice? Who should act, and who might still lose out?

6 REPORT FROM YOUR SEAT

Tally final votes at your table. Count each split once. Prepare your line.

Pair 1 Compared with… Pair 2 The rule changed… Pair 3 Someone still pays…

Lecture term. Distributional tradeoff. A rule can help one group while another group faces a cost.

If time. How would you tell if direct rent aid helps people stay? Who would you compare?

Listen, then decide

Name _____ Your case _____

Funding game / Mark one vote with your partner. KEEP / FUND

Every pair gets 1 point per FUND vote. KEEP adds 3 more to your pair.

Keep your vote hidden from other pairs. Walk-home case only: I'll pay $ _____

Record two different cases besides your own. Short phrases are enough.

Case 1 (letter) ____ What changed and who it affected

Case 2 (letter) ____ What changed and who it affected

Individual exit / Wait for the new campus example.

What the change fixes _____

What problem is still there _____

A case from class and how it helps explain this _____

WHO PICKS UP THE TAB? INDIVIDUAL SLIP

Listen, then decide

Name _____ Your case _____

Funding game / Mark one vote with your partner. KEEP / FUND

Every pair gets 1 point per FUND vote. KEEP adds 3 more to your pair.

Keep your vote hidden from other pairs. Walk-home case only: I'll pay $ _____

Record two different cases besides your own. Short phrases are enough.

Case 1 (letter) ____ What changed and who it affected

Case 2 (letter) ____ What changed and who it affected

Individual exit / Wait for the new campus example.

What the change fixes _____

What problem is still there _____

A case from class and how it helps explain this _____