

THE COMMON FUND

Palestine, 1905–1948 · Class worksheet

Based on Gershon Shafir and Yoav Peled, *Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship* (Cambridge University Press, 2002). A Whose Terms? investigation. Created by Yoav Duman.

Name: _____

Route: Full · 11 decisions

Configured participation

Class settings: Standard class

Required work: decision writing, evidence, explanation checks, reflection pauses, feedback responses, final analysis, new case, source acknowledgment

Writing minima: Decisions 20; analysis 40; new case 30 words when required

Short reflections: 10 words when required

Tasks outside that required-work list are optional; names and policy choices remain required.

Base costs; earlier agreements can change them in the app.

1. 1905 — A wage is also a boundary

Jewish plantation owners often prefer experienced, lower-paid Palestinian crews. Newly arrived European Jewish workers seek higher wages and secure employment. A Zionist donor offers funding reserved for Jewish jobs. Palestinian representatives propose a negotiated wage agreement that also protects existing crews. Your board decides which arrangement to support. The choice connects an immediate livelihood to a rule about future eligibility.

Evidence cards: E02, E04

Choose a rule

() Accept the protected employment grant · 5 base tokens

Rule: Funded jobs are reserved for Jewish workers

() Leave hiring to each employer · 0 base tokens

Rule: Employers set hiring and wages without a common guarantee

() Fund a negotiated wage and job agreement · 8 base tokens

Rule: Covered jobs require a negotiated wage and protection for existing crews

Explanation check: A donor funds only Jewish-reserved jobs, while planters prefer lower-paid Palestinian crews. Which explanation connects the two facts?

() Workers use national finance to protect higher-paid employment by creating a national eligibility boundary.

() Planters adopt the workers' preferred wage because their existing labor-cost interests have changed.

() The fund protects both crews through a common wage agreement negotiated with their representatives.

Explain your decision

Named people: Miriam — Newly arrived Jewish laborer; Yusuf — Palestinian agricultural worker; Leah — Cooperative bookkeeper.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E02 and E04 to explain how your hiring rule changes Miriam's or Yusuf's job security and eligibility.

Evidence selected: _____

2. 1911 — Read the small print

A national landholding body offers your cooperative a lease. Its conditions reserve future leases and employment for Jews. Palestinian tenants already cultivate part of the tract and demand protection for their livelihoods. The board can accept, decline, or seek a smaller agreement with consenting tenants. Signing with the owner does not establish the tenants' consent or erase their occupancy claims.

Evidence cards: E03

Choose a rule

() Accept the national lease conditions · 5 base tokens

Rule: Land and covered employment remain within national eligibility rules

() Decline and pause the expansion · 0 base tokens

Rule: No expansion contract is signed without tenant negotiations

() Negotiate an occupancy and use compact · 8 base tokens

Rule: Cooperative expansion requires tenant consent and enforceable occupancy protections

Explanation check: A tract is bought legally. Which additional finding most clearly shows how the purchase can produce durable national separation?

() National restrictions bind future leases and employment even when a new cooperative takes over.

() The cooperative invests in crops and buildings that give its members a long-term stake.

() Tenant cultivators were not parties to the owner's agreement.

Explain your decision

Named people: Salma — Palestinian tenant cultivator; David — Cooperative agronomist; Esther — National fund liaison.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E03 to explain what your rule changes for Salma's cultivation or consent. Why does the owner's agreement not establish hers?

Evidence selected: _____

Reflection pause 1

Compare your hiring and land decisions. How does one rule extend, limit, or contradict the other's protection of livelihoods?

3. 1912 — The same nation, a different queue

Jewish workers from Yemen request equal wages, housing, and plots. Historically, organizers recruited them as lower-paid replacements for Palestinian labor while giving European Jewish workers greater support. Racialized labels presented Europeans as idealistic pioneers and Yemenites as naturally suited to hardship. These judgments ranked national contribution and justified unequal resources. Your board must decide whether common Jewish belonging brings equal standing.

Evidence cards: E08

Choose a rule

() Keep the inherited graded schedule · 4 base tokens

Rule: Origin and presumed pioneering contribution affect wages and housing

() Replace guarantees with individual piece rates · 0 base tokens

Rule: Workers receive individual contracts without common housing guarantees

() Adopt equal guarantees and shared oversight · 8 base tokens

Rule: Covered workers receive equal wage and housing standards with elected oversight

Explanation check: European and Yemenite Jewish workers both contribute labor but receive different housing and access to public land. Which finding best supports a republican-ranking explanation?

() The groups have different migration histories and different experience in local organizations.

() The allocating body credits one group with idealistic pioneering sacrifice and describes the other as naturally suited to hardship.

() Both groups are recruited as members of the Jewish national population.

Explain your decision

Named people: Shalom — Yemenite Jewish agricultural worker; Rivka — European Jewish cooperative member; Noa — Housing committee clerk.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E08 to explain how Shalom can share Jewish national belonging yet receive lower wages or housing priority. How is his contribution ranked?

Evidence selected: _____

4. 1920 — A union that is more than a union

The Histadrut, founded in 1920, links labor organization with developing economic and social institutions. Affiliation offers your cooperative useful services and access to national resources. It also places decisions within a network whose leaders control valuable benefits. Palestinian workers organize independently and do not necessarily seek incorporation into that project. Decide how your fund will secure services and distribute authority.

Evidence cards: E06, E22

Choose a rule

() Join through nationally bounded membership · 5 base tokens

Rule: Services and cooperative representation follow national affiliation

() Remain an independent contracting office · 0 base tokens

Rule: The fund sells limited services without a shared membership package

() Negotiate a regional service association · 8 base tokens

Rule: Regional services require equal user representation and independent worker organization

Explanation check: Which observation best distinguishes an institutional social right from an individual loyalty gift?

() Recipients identify more strongly with the leadership after obtaining clinic services.

() National funds support a clinic administered through a centralized organizational network.

() People occupying published eligible positions can claim a defined benefit without obtaining a personal favor from an official.

Explain your decision

Named people: Rachel — Cooperative delegate; Khalil — Palestinian worker organizer; Eliyahu — Affiliation advocate.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E06 and E22 to explain what Rachel gains through affiliation and why leaving the leadership's network could be costly. Consider Khalil's independent organization.

Evidence selected: _____

5. 1923 — The clinic door

Your clinic serves members, dependents, and patients outside the membership list. Renewal requires a rule about who can claim care and challenge refusal. Three claimants invoke different grounds: national belonging, contribution to the common project, and individual rights. These grounds can combine. Choose your clinic's rule, then examine whose claim it accepts and who can enforce it.

Evidence cards: E19, E21

Choose a rule

() Guarantee care through existing membership · 4 base tokens

Rule: Clinic entitlements follow recognized fund membership and dues

() Keep only a fee-paying basic service · 0 base tokens

Rule: Clinic use depends on payment with no common sickness guarantee

() Create a local entitlement based on need · 8 base tokens

Rule: Covered local residents have a needs-based clinic claim and an appeal

Citizenship claims: identify the ground invoked by each claim.

Use these terms: Ethno-national; Republican; Liberal.

I belong to the Jewish nation. — _____

My pioneering work earns priority. — _____

Each person has a right to care. — _____

Explain your decision

Named people: Hanna — Clinic nurse; Farid — Palestinian service-user representative; Bracha — Cooperative dues collector.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E19 or E21 to explain Farid's claim to care under your rule. Distinguish two grounds for access and who can challenge a refusal.

Evidence selected: _____

Reflection pause 2

Using E08 or E19, explain why membership does not necessarily mean equal resources or an enforceable claim.

6. 1927 — Who audits the pioneers?

Women in the labor movement gained voting rights but still struggled for independent authority. In 1927, the more independent leadership of the Women Workers' Council was defeated. Pioneering prestige privileged work coded as masculine; care could sustain the project without earning equal standing. Your board faces demands for transparent budgets, recognition of care, and representatives able to challenge leadership.

Evidence cards: E09, E20

Choose a rule

() Entrust reform to the established leadership · 4 base tokens

Rule: The executive retains final control over audits and allocation appeals

() Publish the accounts, defer structural reform · 0 base tokens

Rule: Care work is recognized and accounts are public; the executive retains final authority over agendas and appeals

() Create an independent audit and representation charter · 8 base tokens

Rule: Independent review, protected representation, and paid participation constrain the executive

Explanation check: Women can vote and receive childcare, but officials still set budgets and hear all appeals. Which new fact most clearly shows changed authority rather than only better provision?

() Independent representatives can obtain budget records and enforce a ruling against the executive.

() More women receive childcare under the same allocation and appeal rules.

() More women sit on an advisory committee whose recommendations the executive may decline.

Explain your decision

Named people: Tamar — Women workers' organizer; Shalom — Yemenite Jewish member delegate; Moshe — Long-serving cooperative administrator.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E09 or E20 to explain how Tamar can have a vote yet lack authority. What does your rule change about recognized work or control?

Evidence selected: _____

7. 1933 — Scarcity is not the whole explanation

Your cooperative faces a local shortfall. A national grant offers stability if covered jobs remain exclusive. Yet the historical evidence complicates scarcity as an explanation: campaigns against Arab employment intensified in 1932–1936 amid prosperity and falling unemployment. The Histadrut also faced rival organizations. Choose a response, then test which explanation best fits the historical pattern.

Evidence cards: E11

Choose a rule

() Accept a renewed exclusive employment package · 5 base tokens

Rule: New national support requires renewed exclusive employment conditions

() Contract operations to the existing reserve · 0 base tokens

Rule: No new grant is accepted; services and employment contracts shrink

() Recharter and finance a broader service agreement · 8 base tokens

Rule: New dues support covered workers through a jointly negotiated service charter

Explanation check: The fund's invented shortfall makes scarcity seem plausible. Which historical finding most weakens a scarcity-only explanation of the 1932–1936 exclusion campaigns?

() Campaigns intensified amid declining unemployment and prosperity, while rivals were challenged over their claims to Zionist leadership.

() Jewish workers sought dependable jobs and wages sufficient to support their households.

() Jewish planters had preferred lower-paid Palestinian labor when deciding whom to hire.

Explain your decision

Named people: Leah — Cooperative bookkeeper; Yusuf — Palestinian worker representative; Rivka — Cooperative member.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E11 to test the scarcity explanation: what would falling unemployment predict for Yusuf's job access? Compare this with the historical campaign.

Evidence selected: _____

8. 1936 — An audit under pressure

The Palestinian general strike and revolt begin in 1936, challenging British rule and Zionist settlement. Your board cannot settle that struggle, but it can audit the rules already on its books. Examine jobs, land, benefits, and representation together. A rule may exclude people from membership, rank those included, or do both. Decide what the audit can change.

Evidence cards: E03, E08

Choose a rule

() Consolidate the national service institution · 4 base tokens

Rule: The fund preserves national eligibility and central allocation with a public audit

() Separate services from the governing board · 0 base tokens

Rule: The board transfers direct services and retains an accountable contracts and claims office

() Adopt a local rights and accountability charter · 8 base tokens

Rule: A local charter binds service eligibility, occupancy protections, and independent review

Explanation check: A local charter broadens clinic eligibility, but external land leases remain nationally restricted and British authorities retain political power. Which assessment follows?

() The charter changes a defined local entitlement while distinct land restrictions and colonial political constraints remain operative.

() Because the board cannot change sovereignty, its clinic promise can count only as charity rather than a right.

() Broader clinic access establishes that the overall citizenship regime has been transformed.

Explain your decision

Named people: Salma — Palestinian cultivator representative; Tamar — Women workers' organizer; Shalom — Yemenite Jewish member delegate.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E03 or E08 to compare Salma's eligibility with Shalom's rank among members. How does each rule affect resources or authority?

Evidence selected: _____

9. 1939 — Capacity has a history

During the 1936–1939 revolt, British repression disrupted Palestinian leadership. The strike also reshaped the economy: Jewish replacement labor strengthened the Histadrut’s control of labor supply, while enterprises increasingly turned toward national finance. These processes gave organizations unequal capacities. Your board now reviews emergency arrangements, including whose representatives and records survive. Its choices operate within these wider constraints.

Evidence cards: E13

Choose a rule

() Renew the central emergency service package · 5 base tokens

Rule: Emergency services follow existing national membership under central administration

() End the emergency package, retain basic records · 0 base tokens

Rule: Basic records survive but common emergency services and representation lose support

() Fund relief with independent safeguards · 8 base tokens

Rule: Local emergency aid preserves claimant records and independent user representation

Explanation check: E13 describes British deportation of Palestinian leaders; the book also describes stronger Yishuv labor provision and national finance. What comparison does this evidence support?

() Repression increased relief needs, giving the two populations comparable routes to building central institutions.

() Prior organization explains the resource difference, so colonial repression can be left out of the institutional account.

() Access to finance and accumulated institutions operated alongside unequal coercion to produce different organizational capacities.

Explain your decision

Named people: Khalil — Palestinian worker organizer; Rachel — Cooperative delegate; Leah — Cooperative bookkeeper.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Using E13, contrast Khalil’s organizing constraints with Rachel’s institutional resources. Explain the roles of replacement labor, national finance, and British repression.

Evidence selected: _____

10. Late 1947 — Emergency power is still a rule

In November 1947, the UN recommends partition; war develops before the Mandate ends. The recommendation does not establish an implemented settlement. Your fund must distribute emergency supplies. Established membership rolls offer a ready-made system but omit people with urgent needs and separate tenancy claims. Decide who can claim assistance and whether receiving it can require surrendering another claim.

Evidence cards: E14

Choose a rule

() Route emergency provision through membership · 5 base tokens

Rule: Emergency supplies follow recognized membership and its inherited eligibility rules

() Use a small discretionary relief desk · 0 base tokens

Rule: A small emergency desk grants aid case by case without an enforceable claim

() Guarantee defined relief and protect claims · 8 base tokens

Rule: Emergency assistance follows need and cannot require surrender of tenancy or property claims

Explanation check: A displaced tenant is absent from the current service roll but supplies a witnessed tenancy document. Why preserve a separate claim record?

() The document may support a tenancy claim outside service eligibility, so its record should survive changes to the service roll.

() Registering tenancy evidence should wait until the claimant obtains current service membership.

() A single membership list is a sufficient proxy when families possess different kinds of tenancy evidence.

Explain your decision

Named people: Hanna — Clinic nurse; Farid — Palestinian claimant representative; Eliyahu — Cooperative supply coordinator.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Using E14 and an earlier rule, explain who can claim aid through Hanna's clinic. Identify one outcome beyond the board's authority.

Evidence selected: _____

11. Late 1948 — The new state inherits more than files

Israel is declared in May 1948. Palestinians experience the Nakba: expulsion, flight, dispossession, and blocked return. Your cooperative now operates within the new state. December regulations place covered absentee property under a state custodian; military controls restrict many remaining Palestinians' movement. Earlier fund rules persist alongside these new powers. Decide how services and claimant records cross the transition.

Evidence cards: E16, E18

Choose a rule

() Continue aid through the recognized membership roll · 4 base tokens

Rule: State-era cooperative benefits retain the old membership and priority categories

() Preserve the archive, suspend common benefits · 0 base tokens

Rule: Claimant files survive but the fund no longer guarantees common benefits

() Bind relief to a rights-preserving claims charter · 8 base tokens

Rule: Local aid follows need; records preserve absent claimants and independent review constrains the fund

Explanation check: Which account best explains both institutional continuity and the 1948 change in power?

() New state institutions asserted equality, so formal commitments displaced earlier eligibility and rank as explanations of access.

() New state powers operated alongside inherited networks and classifications, while displacement and blocked return transformed Palestinian access and claims.

() Earlier networks survived, so their organizational continuity is sufficient to explain the new setting without examining state powers.

Explain your decision

Named people: Salma — Displaced Palestinian cultivator; written representation in the case file; Shalom — Yemenite Jewish member delegate; Tamar — Women workers' organizer.

Hint: State your chosen rule, describe its material consequence, and use the source to explain who was left out. Apply one correction or distinction after discussing the check.

Use E16 or E18 to compare how an inherited fund rule and a new state power affect Salma's access. Identify who enforces each.

Evidence selected: _____

Explain your institution

Use two connected rules and two source cards. Explain who gains protection and who has less access or authority. For one benefit, compare two grounds for access. How do your rules reproduce or challenge the book's account?

New case — The Founders' Service Fund

A contemporary city creates a housing and childcare fund after a flood. Read these three fictional records and apply one mechanism from your game.

A • Charter

Housing priority goes to recognized founding volunteers. The founders' committee decides which contributions qualify and sets each member's benefit.

B • Work log

Paid cleaners, migrant workers, and residents doing unpaid care contributed substantial rebuilding work. Several are missing from the founders' list. Committee members receive the first housing offers.

C • Complaints

The founders' committee allocates housing and hears complaints against its own decisions. No independent body can require it to revise an allocation.

Explain how the fund turns recognized contribution into housing priority and authority. Link this to one rule from your game. Propose one enforceable change.

What can these records establish about the city fund?

- () Recognized contribution creates a hierarchy; no ethnic or national membership rule has been supplied.
- () The volunteer hierarchy establishes an ethno-national boundary without further evidence.
- () Because the fund is local, its rules cannot distribute rights or authority.

Historical source references

E02 — Employers and workers did not share one interest

Source locator: Printed pp. 38-41

E03 — Open to purchase, closed afterward

Source locator: Printed pp. 39–40, 46–47

E04 — Subsidies made a protected sector possible

Source locator: Printed pp. 39, 41–42, 45–48

E06 — A union, employer, and provider

Source locator: Printed pp. 40, 47–49

E08 — Shared Jewishness did not mean equal standing

Source locator: Printed pp. 74–76

E09 — Work can sustain the institution yet bring little authority

Source locator: Printed pp. 71, 95–97 The dated 1927 organizing conflict is on printed p. 107; administrative privileges are discussed on p. 64. See also E20.

E11 — Exclusion could serve organizational power

Source locator: Printed p. 41

E13 — Revolt and repression changed institutional capacities

Source locator: Hansard, House of Commons, 4 November 1938, vol. 340, cols. 541–542W; Being Israeli, printed pp. 69–70.

E14 — A partition recommendation was not an implemented settlement

Source locator: A/RES/181(II), opening recommendation; Plan Part I, A–C, especially B.10 and C, Chapter 2

E16 — Displacement could become administrative dispossession

Source locator: Being Israeli, printed pp. 17–18, 53, 110–113; UNCCP A/AC.25/W/10, 2 May 1949, introduction and annex regulations 1(a), 5, and 19(b); UN Mediator A/648, Part One VIII.3(e), VIII.4(i)

E18 — Statehood did not end the frontier within

Source locator: Being Israeli, printed p. 18 and pp. 110–113

E19 — A real right can still have a boundary

Source locator: Being Israeli (2002), printed pp. 60–65, especially pp. 63 and 65.

E20 — Votes, services, and independent women's authority

Source locator: Being Israeli (2002), printed pp. 101, 106–109; gendered contribution pp. 96–98.

E21 — Three grounds for citizenship claims

Source locator: Being Israeli (2002), printed pp. 4–6, 42–45, 63–65, 96–98.

E22 — Leadership can rest on achievements and unequal incorporation

Source locator: Being Israeli (2002), printed pp. 66–73; resources and authority pp. 48–50.

Bibliography

Gershon Shafir and Yoav Peled (2002). Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship — Printed pp. 4–6, 17–18, 37–53, 69–76, 95–97, 110–113 of supplied book

UK Parliament, House of Commons, Malcolm MacDonald, 4 November 1938. Palestine: Deportations, parliamentary written answer — Hansard, vol. 340, cols. 541–542W; answer confirms October 1937 deportations without trial |

<https://api.parliament.uk/historic-hansard/written-answers/1938/nov/04/deportations>

UN General Assembly, 29 November 1947. Resolution 181(II): Future Government of Palestine — Opening recommendation; Plan Part I, A–C | https://avalon.law.yale.edu/20th_century/res181.asp

UN Conciliation Commission for Palestine Secretariat, 2 May 1949. Emergency Regulations on Property of Absentees: UNCCP working paper and annexed 1948 text — A/AC.25/W/10, introduction; annex regulations 1(a), 5, 19(b); regulations issued 2 December 1948 |

<https://unispal.un.org/pdfs/1E1FE62FC7FADC9E85256F9A005927EF.pdf>

Sources and model scope

The cooperative, composite speakers, policy alternatives, token costs, and local outcomes are constructed teaching devices. Source cards identify historical evidence. Local service rules do not repeal external land restrictions. The board cannot determine sovereignty, cause or prevent the Nakba, authorize refugee return, or implement all property remedies. Preserving a claim is different from enforcing a remedy.

All illustrations are contemporary interpretive artwork, not historical documents. Historical evidence and the authors' interpretations are identified separately from constructed local consequences.